

was received prior to the date of the Board's decision, or testimony presented at a hearing resulting from a request for a hearing so referred, together with the evidence already of record, is subsequently found to be the basis of an allowance of that benefit, the effective date of the award will be the same as if the benefit had been granted by the Board as a result of the appeal which was pending at the time that the hearing request or additional evidence was received.

(ii) *Good cause shown.* If good cause is shown, the request for a change in representation or for a personal hearing will be honored. Any pertinent evidence submitted by the appellant or representative will be accepted, subject to the requirements of paragraph (c) of this section if a simultaneously contested claim is involved.

(2) *If the Board obtains evidence or considers law not considered by the agency of original jurisdiction.* The motion described in paragraph (b)(1) of this section is not required to submit evidence in response to the notice described in paragraph (b) or (c) of Rule 903 (paragraph (b) or (c) of §20.903 of this part).

(c) *Simultaneously contested claims.* In simultaneously contested claims, if pertinent evidence which directly affects payment, or potential payment, of the benefit sought is submitted by any claimant and is accepted by the Board under the provisions of this section, the substance of such evidence will be mailed to each of the other claimants who will then have 60 days from the date of mailing of notice of the new evidence within which to comment upon it and/or submit additional evidence in rebuttal. The date of mailing of the letter of notification of the new evidence will be presumed to be the same as the date of that letter for purposes of determining whether such comment or evidence in rebuttal was timely submitted. No further period will be provided for response to such comment or rebuttal evidence.

(Authority: 38 U.S.C. 7104, 7105, 7105A)

[57 FR 4109, Feb. 3, 1992, as amended at 60 FR 25851, May 15, 1995; 61 FR 20453, May 7, 1996; 67 FR 3105, Jan. 23, 2002]

Subpart O—Revision of Decisions on Grounds of Clear and Unmistakable Error

SOURCE: 64 FR 2139, Jan. 13, 1999, unless otherwise noted.

§20.1400 Rule 1400. Motions to revise Board decisions.

(a) Review to determine whether clear and unmistakable error exists in a final Board decision may be initiated by the Board, on its own motion, or by a party to that decision (as the term "party" is defined in Rule 1401(b) (§20.1401(b) of this part) in accordance with Rule 1404 (§20.1404 of this part).

(b) All final Board decisions are subject to revision under this subpart except:

(1) Decisions on issues which have been appealed to and decided by a court of competent jurisdiction; and

(2) Decisions on issues which have subsequently been decided by a court of competent jurisdiction.

(Authority: 38 U.S.C. 501(a), 7111)

[64 FR 2139, Jan 13, 1999, as amended at 64 FR 73414, Dec. 30, 1999]

Sec. 20.1401 Rule 1401. Definitions.

(a) *Issue.* Unless otherwise specified, the term "issue" in this subpart means a matter upon which the Board made a final decision (other than a decision under this subpart). As used in the preceding sentence, a "final decision" is one which was appealable under Chapter 72 of title 38, United States Code, or which would have been so appealable if such provision had been in effect at the time of the decision.

(b) *Party.* As used in this subpart, the term "party" means any party to the proceeding before the Board that resulted in the final Board decision which is the subject of a motion under this subpart, but does not include officials authorized to file administrative appeals pursuant to §19.51 of this title.

(Authority: 38 U.S.C. 501(a), 7104(a))

20.1402 Rule 1402. Inapplicability of other rules.

Motions filed under this subpart are not appeals and, except as otherwise

§ 20.1403

provided, are not subject to the provisions of part 19 of this title or this part 20 which relate to the processing and disposition of appeals.

(Authority: 38 U.S.C. 501(a))

§ 20.1403 Rule 1403. What constitutes clear and unmistakable error; what does not.

(a) *General.* Clear and unmistakable error is a very specific and rare kind of error. It is the kind of error, of fact or of law, that when called to the attention of later reviewers compels the conclusion, to which reasonable minds could not differ, that the result would have been manifestly different but for the error. Generally, either the correct facts, as they were known at the time, were not before the Board, or the statutory and regulatory provisions extant at the time were incorrectly applied.

(b) *Record to be reviewed*—(1) *General.* Review for clear and unmistakable error in a prior Board decision must be based on the record and the law that existed when that decision was made.

(2) *Special rules for Board decisions issued on or after July 21, 1992.* For a Board decision issued on or after July 21, 1992, the record that existed when that decision was made includes relevant documents possessed by the Department of Veterans Affairs not later than 90 days before such record was transferred to the Board for review in reaching that decision, provided that the documents could reasonably be expected to be part of the record.

(c) *Errors that constitute clear and unmistakable error.* To warrant revision of a Board decision on the grounds of clear and unmistakable error, there must have been an error in the Board's adjudication of the appeal which, had it not been made, would have manifestly changed the outcome when it was made. If it is not absolutely clear that a different result would have ensued, the error complained of cannot be clear and unmistakable.

(d) *Examples of situations that are not clear and unmistakable error*—(1) *Changed diagnosis.* A new medical diagnosis that "corrects" an earlier diagnosis considered in a Board decision.

(2) *Duty to assist.* The Secretary's failure to fulfill the duty to assist.

38 CFR Ch. I (7-1-03 Edition)

(3) *Evaluation of evidence.* A disagreement as to how the facts were weighed or evaluated.

(e) *Change in interpretation.* Clear and unmistakable error does not include the otherwise correct application of a statute or regulation where, subsequent to the Board decision challenged, there has been a change in the interpretation of the statute or regulation.

(Authority: 38 U.S.C. 501(a), 7111)

§ 20.1404 Rule 1404. Filing and pleading requirements; withdrawal.

(a) *General.* A motion for revision of a decision based on clear and unmistakable error must be in writing, and must be signed by the moving party or that party's representative. The motion must include the name of the veteran; the name of the moving party if other than the veteran; the applicable Department of Veterans Affairs file number; and the date of the Board of Veterans' Appeals decision to which the motion relates. If the applicable decision involved more than one issue on appeal, the motion must identify the specific issue, or issues, to which the motion pertains. Motions which fail to comply with the requirements set forth in this paragraph shall be dismissed without prejudice to refiling under this subpart.

(b) *Specific allegations required.* The motion must set forth clearly and specifically the alleged clear and unmistakable error, or errors, of fact or law in the Board decision, the legal or factual basis for such allegations, and why the result would have been manifestly different but for the alleged error. Non-specific allegations of failure to follow regulations or failure to give due process, or any other general, non-specific allegations of error, are insufficient to satisfy the requirement of the previous sentence. Motions which fail to comply with the requirements set forth in this paragraph shall be dismissed without prejudice to refiling under this subpart.

(c) *Filing.* A motion for revision of a decision based on clear and unmistakable error may be filed at any time. Such motions should be filed at the following address: Director, Management and Administration (01E), Board of Veterans' Appeals, 810 Vermont Avenue, NW., Washington, DC 20420.