

(c) *Written decision.* The administrative law judge may issue a written initial decision not later than 30 days after the conclusion of the hearing or submission of the last post-hearing brief if the administrative law judge finds that issuing a written initial decision is reasonable. The administrative law judge must serve a copy of any written initial decision on each party.

(d) *Order assessing civil penalty.* Unless appealed pursuant to § 1503.233, the initial decision issued by the administrative law judge will be considered an order assessing civil penalty if the administrative law judge finds that an alleged violation occurred and determines that a civil penalty, in an amount found appropriate by the administrative law judge, is warranted.

**§ 1503.233 Appeal from initial decision.**

(a) *Notice of appeal.* A party may appeal the initial decision, and any decision not previously appealed pursuant to § 1503.219, by filing a notice of appeal with the Enforcement Docket Clerk. A party must file the notice of appeal with the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, Transportation Security Administration, Office of the Chief Counsel, TSA-2, Attention: Enforcement Docket Clerk, 601 South 12th Street, Arlington, VA 22202-4220. A party must file the notice of appeal not later than 10 days after entry of the oral initial decision on the record or service of the written initial decision on the parties and must serve a copy of the notice of appeal on each party.

(b) *Issues on appeal.* A party may appeal only the following issues:

(1) Whether each finding of fact is supported by a preponderance of reliable, probative, and substantial evidence;

(2) Whether each conclusion of law is made in accordance with applicable law, precedent, and public policy; and

(3) Whether the administrative law judge committed any prejudicial errors during the hearing that support the appeal.

(c) *Perfecting an appeal.* Unless otherwise agreed by the parties, a party must perfect an appeal, not later than 50 days after entry of the oral initial decision on the record or service of the written initial decision on the party,

by filing an appeal brief with the Enforcement Docket Clerk.

(1) *Extension of time by agreement of the parties.* The parties may agree to extend the time for perfecting the appeal with the consent of the TSA decision maker. If the TSA decision maker grants an extension of time to perfect the appeal, the Enforcement Docket Clerk will serve a letter confirming the extension of time on each party.

(2) *Written motion for extension.* If the parties do not agree to an extension of time for perfecting an appeal, a party desiring an extension of time may file a written motion for an extension with the Enforcement Docket Clerk and must serve a copy of the motion on each party. The TSA decision maker may grant an extension if good cause for the extension is shown in the motion.

(d) *Appeal briefs.* A party must file the appeal brief with the TSA Enforcement Docket Clerk and must serve a copy of the appeal brief on each party.

(1) A party must set forth, in detail, the party's specific objections to the initial decision or rulings in the appeal brief. A party also must set forth, in detail, the basis for the appeal, the reasons supporting the appeal, and the relief requested in the appeal. If the party relies on evidence contained in the record for the appeal, the party must specifically refer to the pertinent evidence contained in the transcript in the appeal brief.

(2) The TSA decision maker may dismiss an appeal, on the TSA decision maker's own initiative or upon motion of any other party, where a party has filed a notice of appeal but fails to perfect the appeal by timely filing an appeal brief.

(e) *Reply brief.* Unless otherwise agreed by the parties, any party may file a reply brief not later than 35 days after the appeal brief has been served on that party. The party filing the reply brief must serve a copy of the reply brief on each party. If the party relies on evidence contained in the record for the reply, the party must specifically refer to the pertinent evidence contained in the transcript in the reply brief.

(1) *Extension of time by agreement of the parties.* The parties may agree to

extend the time for filing a reply brief with the consent of the TSA decision maker. If the TSA decision maker grants an extension of time to file the reply brief, the Enforcement Docket Clerk will serve a letter confirming the extension of time on each party.

(2) *Written motion for extension.* If the parties do not agree to an extension of time for filing a reply brief, a party desiring an extension of time may file a written motion for an extension and will serve a copy of the motion on each party. The TSA decision maker may grant an extension if good cause for the extension is shown in the motion.

(f) *Other briefs.* The TSA decision maker may allow any person to submit an amicus curiae brief in an appeal of an initial decision. A party may not file more than one appeal brief or reply brief. A party may petition the TSA decision maker, in writing, for leave to file an additional brief and must serve a copy of the petition on each party. The party may not file the additional brief with the petition. The TSA decision maker may grant leave to file an additional brief if the party demonstrates good cause for allowing additional argument on the appeal. The TSA decision maker will allow a reasonable time for the party to file the additional brief.

(g) *Number of copies.* A party must file the original appeal brief or the original reply brief, and two copies of the brief, with the Enforcement Docket Clerk.

(h) *Oral argument.* The TSA decision maker has sole discretion to permit oral argument on the appeal. On the TSA decision maker's own initiative or upon written motion by any party, the TSA decision maker may find that oral argument will contribute substantially to the development of the issues on appeal and may grant the parties an opportunity for oral argument.

(i) *Waiver of objections on appeal.* If a party fails to object to any alleged error regarding the proceedings in an appeal or a reply brief, the party waives any objection to the alleged error. The TSA decision maker is not required to consider any objection in an appeal brief or any argument in the reply brief if a party's objection is based on evidence contained on the record and the party does not specifi-

cally refer to the pertinent evidence from the record in the brief.

(j) *The TSA decision maker's decision on appeal.* The TSA decision maker will review the briefs on appeal and the oral argument, if any, to determine if the administrative law judge committed prejudicial error in the proceedings or that the initial decision should be affirmed, modified, or reversed. The TSA decision maker may affirm, modify, or reverse the initial decision, make any necessary findings, or may remand the case for any proceedings that the TSA decision maker determines may be necessary.

(1) The TSA decision maker may raise any issue, on the TSA decision maker's own initiative, that is required for proper disposition of the proceedings. The TSA decision maker will give the parties a reasonable opportunity to submit arguments on the new issues before making a decision on appeal. If an issue raised by the TSA decision maker requires the consideration of additional testimony or evidence, the TSA decision maker will remand the case to the administrative law judge for further proceedings and an initial decision related to that issue. If an issue raised by the TSA decision maker is solely an issue of law or the issue was addressed at the hearing but was not raised by a party in the briefs on appeal, a remand of the case to the administrative law judge for further proceedings is not required but may be provided in the discretion of the TSA decision maker.

(2) The TSA decision maker will issue the final decision and order of the Administrator on appeal in writing and will serve a copy of the decision and order on each party. Unless a petition for review is filed pursuant to § 1503.235, a final decision and order of the Administrator will be considered an order assessing civil penalty if the TSA decision maker finds that an alleged violation occurred and a civil penalty is warranted.

(3) A final decision and order of the Administrator after appeal is precedent in any other civil penalty action. Any issue, finding or conclusion, order, ruling, or initial decision of an administrative law judge that has not been appealed to the TSA decision maker is

not precedent in any other civil penalty action.

(4) The TSA decision maker will determine whether the decision and order of the TSA decision maker, with the administrative law judge's initial decision or order attached, may be released to the public, either in whole or in redacted form. In making this determination, the TSA decision maker will consider whether disclosure of any of the information in the decision and order would be detrimental to transportation safety, would not be in the public interest, or should not otherwise be required to be made available to the public.

[67 FR 51483, Aug. 8, 2002, as amended at 68 FR 49720, Aug. 19, 2003; 68 FR 58281, Oct. 9, 2003]

**§ 1503.234 Petition to reconsider or modify a final decision and order of the TSA decision maker on appeal.**

(a) *General.* Any party may petition the TSA decision maker to reconsider or modify a final decision and order issued by the TSA decision maker on appeal from an initial decision. A party must file a petition to reconsider or modify not later than 30 days after service of the TSA decision maker's final decision and order on appeal and must serve a copy of the petition on each party. The TSA decision maker will not reconsider or modify an initial decision and order issued by an administrative law judge that has not been appealed by any party to the TSA decision maker and filed with the Enforcement Docket Clerk.

(b) *Form and number of copies.* A party must file a petition to reconsider or modify, in writing. The party must file the original petition with the Enforcement Docket Clerk and must serve a copy of the petition on each party.

(c) *Contents.* A party must state briefly and specifically the alleged errors in the final decision and order on appeal, the relief sought by the party, and the grounds that support the petition to reconsider or modify.

(1) If the petition is based, in whole or in part, on allegations regarding the consequences of the TSA decision maker's decision, the party must describe these allegations and must describe,

and support, the basis for the allegations.

(2) If the petition is based, in whole or in part, on new material not previously raised in the proceedings, the party must set forth the new material and include affidavits of prospective witnesses and authenticated documents that would be introduced in support of the new material. The party must explain, in detail, why the new material was not discovered through due diligence prior to the hearing.

(d) *Repetitious and frivolous petitions.* The TSA decision maker will not consider repetitious or frivolous petitions. The TSA decision maker may summarily dismiss repetitious or frivolous petitions to reconsider or modify.

(e) *Reply petitions.* Any other party may reply to a petition to reconsider or modify, not later than 10 days after service of the petition on that party, by filing a reply with the Enforcement Docket Clerk. A party must serve a copy of the reply on each party.

(f) *Effect of filing petition.* Unless otherwise ordered by the TSA decision maker, filing of a petition pursuant to this section will stay the effective date of the TSA decision maker's final decision and order on appeal.

(g) *The TSA decision maker's decision on petition.* The TSA decision maker has sole discretion to grant or deny a petition to reconsider or modify. The TSA decision maker will grant or deny a petition to reconsider or modify within a reasonable time after receipt of the petition or receipt of the reply petition, if any. The TSA decision maker may affirm, modify, or reverse the final decision and order on appeal, or may remand the case for any proceedings that the TSA decision maker determines may be necessary.

**§ 1503.235 Judicial review of a final order.**

A person may seek judicial review of a final order of the Administrator as provided in 49 U.S.C. 46110. A party seeking judicial review of a final order must file a petition for review not later than 60 days after the final order has been served on the party.