

that, if complaint counsel have objected that the conditions of paragraph (b) of this section have not been met, the Commission shall determine whether to withdraw the matter from adjudication.

(d) *Consideration on the record.* (1) In lieu of a motion to withdraw a matter from adjudication under paragraph (c) of this section, any respondent or respondents may file a motion under this paragraph to dismiss the administrative complaint on the basis that the public interest does not warrant further litigation after a court has denied preliminary injunctive relief to the Commission. Motions filed under this paragraph shall incorporate or be accompanied by a supporting brief or memorandum.

(2) *Stay.* A motion under this paragraph will stay all proceedings before the Administrative Law Judge until such time as the Commission directs otherwise.

(3) *Answer.* Within fourteen (14) days after service of a motion filed under this paragraph, complaint counsel may file an answer.

(4) *Form.* Motions (including any supporting briefs and memoranda) and answers under this paragraph shall not exceed 30 pages if printed, or 45 pages if typewritten, and shall comply with the requirements of § 3.52(e).

(5) *In camera materials.* If any filing includes materials that are subject to confidentiality protections pursuant to an order entered in either the proceeding under section 13(b) or in the proceeding under this part, such materials shall be treated as *In camera* materials for purposes of this paragraph and the party shall file two versions of the document in accordance with the procedures set forth in § 3.45(e). The time within which complaint counsel may file an answer under this paragraph will begin to run upon service of the *in camera* version of the motion (including any supporting briefs and memoranda).

[60 FR 39641, Aug. 3, 1995]

Subpart D—Discovery; Compulsory Process

§ 3.31 General provisions.

(a) *Discovery methods.* Parties may obtain discovery by one or more of the following methods: Depositions upon oral examination or written questions; written interrogatories; production of documents or things for inspection and other purposes; and requests for admission. Unless the Administrative Law Judge orders otherwise, the frequency or sequence of these methods is not limited. The parties shall, to the greatest extent practicable, conduct discovery simultaneously; the fact that a party is conducting discovery shall not operate to delay any other party's discovery.

(b) *Initial disclosures.* Complaint counsel and respondent's counsel shall, within five (5) days of receipt of a respondent's answer to the complaint and without awaiting a discovery request, provide to each other:

(1) The name, and, if known, the address and telephone number of each individual likely to have discoverable information relevant to the allegations of the Commission's complaint, to the proposed relief, or to the defenses of the respondent, as set forth in § 3.31(c)(1);

(2) A copy of, or a description by category and location of, all documents, data compilations, and tangible things in the possession, custody, or control of the Commission or respondent(s) that are relevant to the allegations of the Commission's complaint, to the proposed relief, or to the defenses of the respondent, as set forth in § 3.31(c)(1); unless such information or materials are privileged as defined in § 3.31(c)(2), pertain to hearing preparation as defined in § 3.31(c)(3), pertain to experts as defined in § 3.31(c)(4), or are obtainable from some other source that is more convenient, less burdensome, or less expensive. A party shall make its disclosures based on the information then reasonably available to it and is not excused from making its disclosures because it has not fully completed its investigation.

(3) In addition to the disclosures required by paragraphs (b)(1) and (2), of this section, the parties shall disclose

to each other the identity of any person who may be used at trial to present evidence as an expert. Except as otherwise stipulated or directed by the Administrative Law Judge, this disclosure shall, with respect to a witness who is retained or specially employed to provide expert testimony in the case or whose duties as an employee of the party regularly involve giving expert testimony, be accompanied by a written report prepared and signed by the witness. The report shall contain a complete statement of all opinions to be expressed and the basis and reasons therefor; the data or other information considered by the witness in forming the opinions; any exhibits to be used as a summary of or support for the opinions; the qualifications of the witness, including a list of all publications authored by the witness within the preceding ten years; the compensation to be paid for the study and testimony; and a listing of any other cases in which the witness has testified as an expert at trial or by deposition within the preceding four years. These disclosures shall be made at the times and in the sequence directed by the Administrative Law Judge. In the absence of other directions from the Administrative Law Judge or stipulation by the parties, the disclosures shall be made at least 90 days before the trial date or the date the case is to be ready for trial or, if the evidence is intended solely to contradict or rebut proposed expert testimony on the same subject matter identified by another party under this paragraph, within 30 days after the disclosure made by the other party.

(c) *Scope of discovery.* Unless otherwise limited by order of the Administrative Law Judge or the Commission in accordance with these rules, the scope of discovery is as follows:

(1) *In general; limitations.* Parties may obtain discovery to the extent that it may be reasonably expected to yield information relevant to the allegations of the complaint, to the proposed relief, or to the defenses of any respondent. Such information may include the existence, description, nature, custody, condition and location of any books, documents, or other tangible things and the identity and location of per-

sons having any knowledge of any discoverable matter. Information may not be withheld from discovery on grounds that the information will be inadmissible at the hearing if the information sought appears reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of admissible evidence. The frequency or extent of use of the discovery methods otherwise permitted under these rules shall be limited by the Administrative Law Judge if he determines that:

(i) The discovery sought is unreasonably cumulative or duplicative, or is obtainable from some other source that is more convenient, less burdensome, or less expensive;

(ii) The party seeking discovery has had ample opportunity by discovery in the action to obtain the information sought; or

(iii) The burden and expense of the proposed discovery outweigh its likely benefit.

(2) *Privilege.* The Administrative Law Judge may enter a protective order denying or limiting discovery to preserve the privilege of a witness, person, or governmental agency as governed by the Constitution, any applicable act of Congress, or the principles of the common law as they may be interpreted by the Commission in the light of reason and experience.

(3) *Hearing preparations: Materials.* Subject to the provisions of paragraph (c)(4) of this section, a party may obtain discovery of documents and tangible things otherwise discoverable under paragraph (c)(1) of this section and prepared in anticipation of litigation or for hearing by or for another party or by or for that other party's representative (including the party's attorney, consultant, or agent) only upon a showing that the party seeking discovery has substantial need of the materials in the preparation of its case and that the party is unable without undue hardship to obtain the substantial equivalent of the materials by other means. In ordering discovery of such materials when the required showing has been made, the Administrative Law Judge shall protect against disclosure of the mental impressions, conclusions, opinions, or legal theories of an attorney or other representative of a party.

Federal Trade Commission

§ 3.32

(4) *Hearing Preparation: Experts.* (i) A party may depose any person who has been identified as an expert whose opinions may be presented at trial. If a report from the expert is required under § 3.31(b)(3), the deposition shall not be conducted until after the report is provided.

(A) A party may through interrogatories require any other party to identify each person whom the other party expects to call as an expert witness at hearing, to state the subject matter on which the expert is expected to testify, and to state the substance of the facts and opinions to which the expert is expected to testify and a summary of the grounds for each opinion.

(B) Upon motion, the Administrative Law Judge may order further discovery by other means, subject to such restrictions as to scope as the Administrative Law Judge may deem appropriate.

(ii) A party may discover facts known or opinions held by an expert who has been retained or specially employed by another party in anticipation of litigation or preparation for hearing and who is not expected to be called as a witness at hearing, only upon a showing of exceptional circumstances under which it is impracticable for the party seeking discovery to obtain facts or opinions on the same subject by other means.

(d) *Protective orders; order to preserve evidence.* (1) The Administrative Law Judge may deny discovery or make any order which justice requires to protect a party or other person from annoyance, embarrassment, oppression, or undue burden or expense, or to prevent undue delay in the proceeding. Such an order may also be issued to preserve evidence upon a showing that there is substantial reason to believe that such evidence would not otherwise be available for presentation at the hearing.

(2) [Reserved]

(e) *Supplementation of disclosures and responses.* A party who has made an initial disclosure under § 3.31(b) or responded to a request for discovery with a disclosure or response is under a duty to supplement or correct the disclosure or response to include information thereafter acquired if ordered by the

Administrative Law Judge or in the following circumstances:

(1) A party is under a duty to supplement at appropriate intervals its initial disclosures under § 3.31(b) if the party learns that in some material respect the information disclosed is incomplete or incorrect and if the additional or corrective information has not otherwise been made known to the other parties during the discovery process or in writing.

(2) A party is under a duty seasonably to amend a prior response to an interrogatory, request for production, or request for admission if the party learns that the response is in some material respect incomplete or incorrect.

(f) *Stipulations.* When approved by the Administrative Law Judge, the parties may by written stipulation (1) provide that depositions may be taken before any person, at any time or place, upon any notice, and in any manner and when so taken may be used like other depositions, and (2) modify the procedures provided by these rules for other methods of discovery.

(g) *Ex parte rulings on applications for compulsory process.* Applications for the issuance of subpoenas to compel testimony at an adjudicative hearing pursuant to § 3.34 may be made *ex parte*, and, if so made, such applications and rulings thereon shall remain *ex parte* unless otherwise ordered by the Administrative Law Judge or the Commission.

[43 FR 56864, Dec. 4, 1978, as amended at 50 FR 53305, Dec. 31, 1985; 61 FR 50647, Sept. 26, 1996; 66 FR 17628, Apr. 3, 2001; 66 FR 20527, Apr. 23, 2001]

§ 3.32 Admissions.

(a) At any time after thirty (30) days after issuance of complaint, or after publication of notice of an adjudicative hearing in a rulemaking proceeding under § 3.13, any party may serve on any other party a written request for admission of the truth of any matters relevant to the pending proceeding set forth in the request that relate to statements or opinions of fact or of the application of law to fact, including the genuineness of any documents described in the request. Copies of documents shall be served with the request unless they have been or are otherwise furnished or are known to be, and in