

Environmental Protection Agency

§ 57.811

presiding at the stage of the hearing then in progress may, to the extent consistent with justice and the policy of the Clean Air Act, require the party to show cause why its claim or interest in the proceedings should not be dismissed, denied, disregarded, or otherwise adversely affected on account of such violation.

(c) *Definitions.* For purposes of this section, the following definitions shall apply:

(1) *Agency trial staff* means those Agency employees, whether temporary or permanent, who have been designated by the Agency as available to investigate, litigate, and present the evidence arguments and position of the Agency in the evidentiary hearing or non-adversary panel hearing. Appearance as a witness does not necessarily require a person to be designated as a member of the Agency trial staff;

(2) *Decisional body* means any Agency employee who is or may be reasonably expected to be involved in the decisional process of the proceeding including the Administrator, Presiding Officer, the Regional Administrator (if he does not designate himself as a member of the Agency trial staff), and any of their staff participating in the decisional process. In the case of a non-adversary panel hearing, the decisional body shall also include the panel members whether or not permanently employed by the Agency;

(3) *Ex parte communication* means any communication, written or oral, relating to the merits of the proceeding between the decisional body and an interested person outside the Agency or the Agency trial staff which was not originally filed or stated in the administrative record or in the hearing. *Ex parte* communications do not include:

(i) Communications between Agency employees other than between the Agency trial staff and the member of the decisional body;

(ii) Discussions between the decisional body and either:

(A) Interested persons outside the Agency, or;

(B) The Agency trial staff if all parties have received prior written notice of such proposed communications and have been given the opportunity to be present and participate therein.

(4) *Interested person outside the Agency* includes the smelter owner, any person who filed written comments in the proceeding, any person who requested the hearing, any person who requested to participate or intervene in the hearing, any participant or party in the hearing and any other interested person not employed by the Agency at the time of the communications, and the attorney of record for such persons.

[50 FR 6448, Feb. 15, 1985, as amended at 57 FR 5328, Feb. 13, 1992]

§ 57.810 Filing of briefs, proposed findings, and proposed recommendations.

Unless otherwise ordered by the Presiding Officer, each hearing participant may, within 20 days after reply comments are submitted under § 57.805(b), or if a supplementary hearing for the purpose of cross-examination has been held under § 57.808(c), within 20 days after the transcript of such supplementary hearing becomes available or if alternative methods of clarifying the record have been used under § 57.808(d), within 20 days after the alternative methods have been employed, file with the Hearing Clerk and serve upon all other hearing participants proposed findings and proposed recommendations to replace in whole or in part the findings and recommendations contained in the tentative determination. Any such person may also file, at the same time, a brief in support of his proposals, together with references to relevant pages of transcript and to relevant exhibits. Within 10 days thereafter each participant may file a reply brief concerning alternative proposals. Oral argument may be held at the discretion of the Presiding Officer on motion of any hearing participant or sua sponte.

§ 57.811 Recommended decision.

As soon as practicable after the conclusion of the hearing, one or more responsible employees of the Agency shall evaluate the record for preparation of a recommended decision and shall prepare and file a recommended decision with the Hearing Clerk. The employee(s) preparing the decision will generally be members of the hearing panel and may include the Presiding

§ 57.812

Officer. Such employee(s) may consult with and receive assistance from any member of the hearing panel in drafting a recommended decision and may also delegate the preparation of the recommended decision to the panel or to any member or members of it. This decision shall contain the same elements as the tentative determination. After the recommended decision has been filed, the Hearing Clerk shall serve a copy of such decision on each hearing participant and upon the Administrator.

§ 57.812 Appeal from or review of recommended decision.

(a) *Exceptions.* (1) Within 20 days after service of the recommended decision, any hearing participant may take exception to any matter set forth in such decision or to any adverse order or ruling of the Presiding Officer prior to or during the hearing to which such participant objected, and may appeal such exceptions to the Administrator by filing them in writing with the Hearing Clerk. Such exceptions shall contain alternative findings and recommendations, together with references to the relevant pages of the record and recommended decision. A copy of each document taking exception to the recommended decision shall be served upon every other hearing participant. Within the same period of time each party filing exceptions shall file with the Administrator and shall serve upon all hearing participants a brief concerning each of the exceptions being appealed. Each brief shall include page references to the relevant portions of the record and to the recommended decision.

(2) Within 10 days of the service of exceptions and briefs under paragraph (a)(1) of this section, any hearing participant may file and serve a reply brief responding to exceptions or arguments raised by any other hearing participant together with references to the relevant portions of the record, recommended decision, or opposing brief. Reply briefs shall not, however, raise additional exceptions.

(b) *Sua sponte review by the Administrator.* Whenever the Administrator determines *sua sponte* to review a recommended decision, notice of such in-

40 CFR Ch. I (7-1-08 Edition)

tention shall be served upon the parties by the Hearing Clerk within 30 days after the date of service of the recommended decision. Such notice shall include a statement of issues to be briefed by the hearing participants and a time schedule for the service and filing of briefs.

(c) *Scope of appeal or review.* The appeal of the recommended decision shall be limited to the issues raised by the appellant, except when the Administrator determines that additional issues should be briefed or argued. If the Administrator determines that briefing or argument of additional issues is warranted, all hearing participants shall be given reasonable written notice of such determination to permit preparation of adequate argument.

(d) *Argument before the Administrator.* The Administrator may, upon request by a party or *sua sponte*, set a matter for oral argument. The time and place for such oral argument shall be assigned after giving consideration to the convenience of the parties.

§ 57.813 Final decision.

(a) *After review.* As soon as practicable after all appeal or other review proceedings have been completed, the Administrator shall issue his final decision. Such a final decision shall include the same elements as the recommended decision, as well as any additional reasons supporting his decisions on exceptions filed by hearing participants. The final decision may accept or reject all or part of the recommended decision. The Administrator may consult with the Presiding Officer, members of the hearing panel or any other EPA employee in preparing his final decision. The Hearing Clerk shall file a copy of the decision on all hearing participants.

(b) *In the absence of review.* If no party appeals a recommended decision to the Administrator and if the Administrator does not review it *sua sponte*, he shall be deemed to have adopted the recommended decision as the final decision of the Agency upon the expiration of the time for filing any exceptions under § 57.812(a).

(c) *Timing of judicial review.* For purposes of judicial review, final Agency action on a request for a waiver of the