

§ 78.5

40 CFR Ch. I (7–1–08 Edition)

and his or her attorney or duly authorized representative.

(g) Affidavits filed under this part shall be made on personal knowledge and belief, set forth only those facts that are admissible into evidence under § 78.5 of this part, and show affirmatively that the affiant is competent to testify to the matters stated therein.

[58 FR 3760, Jan. 11, 1993, as amended at 62 FR 55488, Oct. 24, 1997; 62 FR 66279, Dec. 18, 1997; 69 FR 21645, Apr. 21, 2004; 70 FR 25339, May 12, 2005]

§ 78.5 Limitation on filing or presenting new evidence and raising new issues.

(a) Where there was an opportunity for public comment prior to the decision that is subject to appeal, no evidence shall be filed or presented, and no issues raised, in a proceeding under this part that were not filed, presented, or raised during the public comment period, absent a showing of good cause explaining the party's failure to do so during the public comment period. Good cause shall include any instance where the party seeking to file or present new evidence or raise a new issue shows that the evidence could not have reasonably been ascertained, filed, or presented, the issue could not have reasonably been ascertained or raised, or that the materiality of the new evidence or issue could not have reasonably been anticipated, prior to the close of the public comment period.

(b) If an evidentiary hearing is granted, no evidence shall be filed or presented on questions of law or policy or on matters not subject to challenge in the evidentiary hearing.

[58 FR 3760, Jan. 11, 1993, as amended at 62 FR 55488, Oct. 24, 1997; 70 FR 25339, May 12, 2005]

§ 78.6 Action on petition for administrative review.

(a) If no evidentiary hearing concerning the petition for review is requested or is to be held, the Environmental Appeals Board will issue an order under § 78.20(c) of this part.

(b)(1) The Environmental Appeals Board may grant a request for an evidentiary hearing, or schedule an evidentiary hearing *sua sponte*, if the Environmental Appeals Board finds that

there are disputed issues of fact material to contested portions of the decision and determines, in its discretion, that an opportunity for direct- and cross-examination of witnesses may be necessary in order to resolve these factual issues.

(2) To the extent the Environmental Appeals Board grants a request for an evidentiary hearing, in whole or in part, it will:

(i) Identify the portions of the decision that have been contested, and the disputed factual issues that have been raised by the petitioner with regard to which the evidentiary hearing has been granted; and

(ii) Refer the disputed factual issues to the Chief Administrative Law Judge for decision and, in its discretion, may also refer all or a portion of the remaining legal, policy, or factual issues to the Chief Administrative Law Judge for decision.

(3)(i) After issues are referred to the Chief Administrative Law Judge, he or she will designate an Administrative Law Judge as Presiding Officer to conduct the evidentiary hearing.

(ii) Notwithstanding paragraph (b)(3)(i) of this section, if all parties waive in writing their right to have an Administrative Law Judge designated as the Presiding Officer, the Administrator may designate a lawyer permanently or temporarily employed by EPA and without any prior connection with the proceeding to serve as Presiding Officer.

§ 78.7 [Reserved]

§ 78.8 Consolidation and severance of appeals proceedings.

(a) The Environmental Appeals Board or Presiding Officer has the discretion to consolidate, in whole or in part, two or more proceedings under this part whenever it appears that a joint proceeding on any or all of the matters at issue in the proceedings will be in the interest of justice, will expedite or simplify consideration of the issues, and will not prejudice any party. Consolidation of proceedings under this paragraph (a) will not affect the right of any party to raise issues that might have been raised had there been no consolidation.

Environmental Protection Agency

§ 78.12

(b) The Environmental Appeals Board or Presiding Officer has the discretion to sever issues or parties from a proceeding under this part whenever it appears that separate proceedings will be in the interest of justice, will expedite or simplify consideration of the issues, and will not prejudice any party.

§ 78.9 Notice of the filing of petition for administrative review.

The Administrator will publish in the FEDERAL REGISTER a notice stating that a petition for administrative review of a decision of the Administrator has been filed and specifying any request in the petition for an evidentiary hearing.

§ 78.10 *Ex parte* communications during pendency of a hearing.

(a)(1) No party or interested person outside EPA, representative of a party or interested person, or member of the EPA trial staff shall make, or knowingly cause to be made, to any member of the decisional body an *ex parte* communication on the merits of a proceeding under this part.

(2) No member of the decisional body shall make, or knowingly cause to be made, to any party or interested person outside EPA, representative of a party or interested person, or member of the EPA trial staff, an *ex parte* communication on the merits of any proceeding under this part.

(3) A member of the decisional body who receives, makes, or knowingly causes to be made an *ex parte* communication prohibited by this paragraph shall file with the Environmental Appeals Board (or, if the proceeding is pending before an Administrative Law Judge, with the Hearing Clerk) for inclusion in the record of the proceeding under this part any such written *ex parte* communications and memoranda stating the substance of any such oral *ex parte* communication.

(b) Whenever any member of the decisional body receives an *ex parte* communication made, or knowingly caused to be made by a party or representative of a party to a proceeding under this part, the person presiding over the proceedings then in progress may, to the extent consistent with justice, require the party to show good

cause why its claim or interest in the proceedings should not be dismissed, denied, disregarded, or otherwise adversely affected on account of these *ex parte* communications.

(c) The prohibitions of paragraph (a) of this section shall begin to apply upon publication by the Administrator of the notice of the filing of a petition under § 78.9 of this part. This prohibition terminates on the date of final agency action.

§ 78.11 Intervenor.

(a) Within 30 days (or other shorter, reasonable period established by the Administrator when giving notice) after notice is given under § 78.9 of this part that the petition for administrative review has been filed, any person listed in § 78.3(a) of this part may file a motion for leave to intervene in the proceeding. A motion for leave to intervene under this section shall set forth the grounds for the proposed intervention and may respond to the petition for administrative review. Late motions to intervene may be granted only for good cause shown.

(b) The Environmental Appeals Board of Presiding Officer will grant a motion to intervene only upon an express finding that:

(1) The motion to intervene raises matters relevant to the factual or legal issues to be reviewed;

(2) The intervenor consented to be bound by all stipulations previously entered into by the existing parties, and all orders previously issued, in the proceeding; and

(3) The intervention will promote the interests of justice and will not cause undue delay or prejudice to the rights of the existing parties.

[58 FR 3760, Jan. 11, 1993, as amended at 62 FR 55488, Oct. 24, 1997]

§ 78.12 Standard of review.

(a) On appeal of a decision of the Administrator prior to which there was an opportunity for public comment:

(1) Except as provided under paragraph (a)(2) of this section, the petitioner shall have the burden of going forward and of persuasion to show that a finding of fact or conclusion of law underlying the decision is clearly erroneous or that an exercise of discretion